

Below you will find a draft Section 6, to be reviewed this Sunday from 2-4 at Harmony School Gymnasium. The topic is demolition and relocation of structures within the new district. After this small but important section you will find a draft of the beginning of the guidelines, Section 1, which aren't really guidelines but pertain more to their function and how you read them. Eventually the history of the neighborhood will also be included in this area.

DRAFT

6.0 RELOCATION AND DEMOLITION

The purpose of a local historic district is to preserve and protect the buildings, settings and places of architectural and historical significance to a neighborhood or community. This makes it inappropriate to remove structures which have been listed as contributing to a district. Most construction within the Elm Heights Historic District took place between 1920 and the 1940's. The houses that had already been built in the area were carefully worked into the fabric of the new community; along with their more modern brethren these older homes create a district rich in architectural diversity.

Preservation Goals

To protect the contributing homes and structures that together constitutes the historic district.

To preserve the historic context and value of the district by discouraging the relocation of its structures.

Guidelines for Demolition and Relocation

A Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) s required for the following bolded, numbered items. The bullet points that follow each numbered item give some examples the BHPC may consider valid reasons to grant a demolition or relocation.

- I. Demolition of all primary and secondary, and accessory structures, including contributing walls and fences.**
 - The structure poses an immediate and substantial threat to public safety as interpreted from the state of deterioration, disrepair, and structural stability of the structure. The condition of the building or structure resulting from neglect shall not be considered grounds for demolition.
 - Upon further consideration by the Commission, the historic or architectural significance of the structure is such that it does not contribute to the historic character of the district.
 - The demolition is necessary to allow development which, in the Commission's opinion, is of greater significance to the preservation of the district than is retention of the structure, or portion thereof, for which demolition is sought.
 - The structure is accidentally damaged by storm, fire, flood or natural disaster. In this case, it may be rebuilt to its former configuration and materials without regard to these guidelines if work is commenced within 6 months.

- The structure or property cannot be put to any reasonable economically beneficial use without the approval of the demolition.

II. Relocation, either within or outside the district, of primary, secondary, and accessory structures, including contributing walls and fences.

- Upon further consideration by the Commission, the historic or architectural significance of the structure is such that it does not contribute to the historic character of the district.
- Relocation is necessary to allow development which, in the Commission's opinion, is of greater significance to the preservation of the district than is retention of the structure in its original location.
- Any buildings that are moved should be compatible with the contributing architecture surrounding its' new site relative to style, setting, scale, and era.

Things to Consider as You Plan

DRAFT

The replacement of demolished or relocated properties should follow new construction guidelines except for the situation presented above in the fourth bullet point.

Box - Refer to section 2.0 HISTORIC PRESERVATION AND SUSTAINABILITY under *Environmental Health* to find more information on the topic of sustainability and demolition.

On the following page you will find a draft of Section 1 from the proposed guidelines document. This section pertains to the function of the guidelines and how to read and use them. Eventually a short history of the neighborhood will be also included in this area.

DRAFT

The Elm Heights Historic District is established to promote a sense of community among a diverse population by working toward a set of flexible goals which include preservation and protection of our neighborhood's diverse architectural significance and retention of its historical integrity and fabric. To encourage a balanced approach, the district adopts a set of flexible guidelines that focuses on the conservation of green spaces, the ability to age gracefully in place, and ecologically sound energy practices that include alternative energy sources as well as a working relationship with the city.

The Elm Heights Subcommittee

Beth Baxter, Kathy Holland
Olga Diamondis, Virginia Metzger
Richard Durisen, Jenny Southern
Jaden Falcone, Jody Wintsch

Carolyn Geduld

Commissioners Danielle Bachant-Bell, Sandra Clothier

These Design Guidelines were developed by residents of the Elm Heights Historic District. They are intended to assist homeowners by helping them make informed decisions about their historic homes and properties. Most of the information provided here is simple instruction concerning the treatment and repair of older materials in ways that will make them last. The underlying goal is to preserve the elements of the district that create its historic atmosphere but also to acknowledge the advantages of reuse, renovation, and repair.

New with these guidelines is a section on sustainability and the use of new technologies. We hope to encourage their use by integrating them into our guidelines in clear and actionable ways.



DRAFT

Contents



DRAFT

1. Introduction

1.1 Preface

1.2 Table of Contents

1.3 Map of Elm Heights Historic District

1.4 History of Elm Heights

1.5 Design Guidelines Overview

1.6 How to use the Design Guidelines

1.7 Certificates of Appropriateness

2. Historic Preservation and Sustainability

3. Neighborhood Site and Setting

3.1 Trees and Landscaping

3.2 Trellises, Gazebos, Pergolas, and Similar Small Structures

3.3 Walls and Fences

3.4 Walkways and Automobile Areas

3.5 Lighting

3.6 Other Landscape Features

4. Existing Buildings and Materials

4.1 Wood

4.2 Masonry

4.3 Architectural Metals

4.4 Roofs

4.5 Windows and Doors

5. Additions, Retrofits, and New Construction

5.1 New Construction

5.2 Patios, Terraces, and Decks

5.3 New Garages and Service Building

5.4 Porches and Porticos

5.5 Sustainability and Energy Retrofits

5.6 Accessibility, Safety, and Aging in Place

6. Relocation and Demolition

7. Appendices

7.1 Maintenance, Project Planning and Restoration Resources

7.2 Glossary of Terms

7.3 Procedures for Guidelines Review and Enforcement

7.4 Secretary of Interior Standards

7.5 City's Tree Care Manual

1.3 Elm Heights District Map

Place Map Here



1.4 History of Elm Heights

Place History Here

1.5 DESIGN GUIDELINES OVERVIEW

Classification

Following historic preservation laws and ordinances, all homes within a district are classified in one of four categories:

- **Outstanding** - an outstanding resource so significant that it is individually eligible for the National Register of Historic Places.
- **Notable** - a building that, upon further research, may be eligible to be listed in the National Register of Historic Places.
- **Contributing** – a building that meets the basic criterion of being at least 40 years old but is not sufficiently significant to stand on its own.
- **Non-contributing** – a building either too recently built or so severely altered so as to be no longer contributing to the historic fabric of the district. Non-contributing properties will have less restrictive review of existing exterior building changes, but additions and setting elements will require review.

It is customary to refer to outstanding, notable and contributing resources as “contributing” because they all have historic value. The architectural and historic significance of the property is always considered first. If you live in an outstanding home, changes to the exterior will be more sensitive than in a non-contributing or contributing home.

Unique Materials

Historic resources illustrate the past and instruct us about the different ways that we have lived as a society. Durable and natural materials like wood, limestone and slate were the original building materials and have the added advantage of being able to endure much longer than modern petroleum-based replacement products. It is important to prioritize repair and replacement in kind rather than wholesale replacement with inferior materials.

Visibility

The presentation of the house or property to the street, its public interface, is its most important asset. When possible, major changes should be placed on secondary elevations, taking care not to damage existing historic materials. Throughout the guidelines, we use the term “visible from the public right-of-way” to highlight this emphasis. Temporary visibility obstructions like fences and landscaping do not remove a property or its features from the review process. This document

and the Commission are dedicated to finding the least obtrusive solution for those proposals while implementing suggested changes.

New Construction

Additions and new accessory structures should be consistent in style and scale to the main structure. New residences should be compatible with surrounding contributing properties in placement, proportion, scale, materials, features, and setting.

1.6 HOW TO USE THESE DESIGN GUIDELINES

Start with the index and find the topic appropriate to your project.

Is it repair to an existing building?

Is it new construction?

What materials are affected?



DRAFT

Each topic in this booklet is divided into four sections:

1. Description

Defines the subject and its importance, then describes how it relates to the Elm Heights neighborhood.

2. Preservation Goals

Clearly explains **the neighborhood's as well as** the Commission's approach to the feature or action and the goals **we hope to achieve by means of the Guidelines.**

3. Guidelines

These are the items that **must be** reviewed by the Commission and require a Certificate of Appropriateness. This section outlines desired treatments and things to avoid and is always set aside in a graphic box

4. Things to Consider as You Plan

Provides additional helpful information about the care and maintenance of historic homes and property in Elm Heights.

1.7 CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

A Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) is issued by Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission after reviewing plans for proposed work on a designated historic building. The Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission (BHPC) reviews these applications or proposals for work **based on** the guidelines in this book. Guidelines do not dictate; they provide a range of ways to approach specific design issues. If the proposed changes are generally in conformance with the information in this document, then a COA is issued.

During the meeting, Commission members may suggest changes to bring the application into conformance. A COA must have an official response from the commission within 30 days of filing a complete application. The COA should be presented with the building permit application. A COA is much like a building permit, which the property owner must display in a prominent location at the site where the work is taking place.

Things that do not require a COA

These guidelines for preservation, rehabilitation, restoration, and new construction in Elm Heights ensure that everyone's investment in the neighborhood is protected. Some minor reviews can be done at the staff level. Please call Commission staff for more information (349-3507) You do **not** need to apply for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the following:

- Anything not visible from a public right-of-way (See "visibility" above for more information)
- Routine maintenance, for example, the reglazing of a broken window pane or minor repairs done in-kind (of the same or similar materials)
- Removal of dead or invasive trees
- Changing paint color where paint is the existing application
- Any change to the interior of your home
- Flower and vegetable gardens, and tree pruning
- Installation of rain barrels if copper gutters are not involved



Should there be a bullet here for reroofing if it doesn't involve a change of materials? How about building additions?

2.0 HISTORIC PRESERVATION AND SUSTAINABILITY

Sustainability, in all its aspects, is a critical issue for our community, and the residents of Elm Heights Historic District recognize the intimate connection between sustainability and historic preservation. The guidelines set forth in this document support the goals of sustainability, and a flexible, solution-oriented approach should be used to balance cost-effective implementation of sustainability initiatives with preservation of the historic character of Elm Heights. As laid out in the City of Bloomington's Sustainability Initiative, there are three components to sustainability that fall under the broad categories of *environmental health*, *social well-being*, and *economic prosperity*. Through the following discussion of the connection between historic preservation and sustainability in these three areas, we clarify how sustainability principles motivate many of the preservation guidelines in this document and explain why those interested in developing a sustainable future for our community support the creation of the Elm Heights Historic District.

Environmental Health

The environmental component of sustainability is often the primary focus when discussing historic buildings. However, sustainable development and conservation of resources share a common goal: a building that uses less energy and creates lower carbon emissions. When an existing building is demolished, the embodied energy that went into its creation is lost. More energy is expended to demolish and haul away the building materials, while the debris further burdens landfills. Although some may think that new construction will be more efficient, it can take decades of utility savings in a new building, even a "green" one, to equal the loss of energy represented by the demolition. An additional carbon debt is incurred in building the new structure, and this can require additional decades of energy savings to offset.

Resource conservation and preservation is sustainability in its most basic manifestation. Historic properties are often the best candidates for energy upgrades and reuse because many buildings built in the pre-oil age already incorporated natural ventilation and lighting features. Moreover, they were constructed for longevity with durable materials that **embody** sustainability. A good illustration of this is existing windows, which can usually be repaired and upgraded. When old windows are replaced, it can take many more years of energy savings to recoup the cost of the new windows when compared with the lower cost to repair the old ones and add storm windows. Replacement windows are often not very durable compared with the originals, and their manufacture typically involves use of fossil fuels and the creation of toxic byproducts. Similarly, preservation of mature tree canopy and green space, in addition to creating a pleasant atmosphere, contributes to sustainability in several ways, including energy conservation and water management.

DRAFT

Social Well-Being

Neighborhoods like Elm Heights encourage sustainable life styles. There is demonstrated value to living on small urban lots, flanked by alleys, with ready access to downtown by foot and bicycle. In contrast to more modern housing developments, the Elm Heights Neighborhood, with its small bungalows, duplexes, rooming houses, and elegant larger homes, provides a wide variety of housing options, all within easy access to public transportation, downtown resources, and education opportunities from kindergarten through college. Preservation of older neighborhoods, with their compact form, walkability, and green space, help retain the social fabric of the city by encouraging neighbor interaction and outdoor activities. The values supported are inherent: thrift, energy conservation, and personal health. Historic landscapes, sites, structures, buildings, and features form a neighborhood's unique identity, and preservation of these resources maintains a connection to the community's heritage. Intact historic neighborhoods engender a sense of place and anchor a resident's identity with the community.

Economic Prosperity

The economic benefit of historic preservation and historic districts is well documented, including increased property values, owner-occupancy, local job creation in rehabilitation industries, and heritage tourism. As quality of life improves and investments are made, similar positive effects are **experienced by** surrounding areas. Rehabilitation projects generate both direct and indirect economic benefits. The local purchase of labor and materials is the direct benefit, while the manufacture and transport of materials are indirect benefits. With the increasing cost of energy, conservation through rehabilitation is also a measurable economic benefit.

Alternative Energy and Other Sustainability Practices

As laid out in the discussions above, historic preservation and sustainability are mutually reinforcing activities. However, some sustainability practices are not directly related to historic preservation and have, in other communities, been treated as potentially undesirable because of the alterations they might require in an historic property. There is, however, a growing national recognition that alternative energy and ecologically sound practices should be an integral part of

historic preservation in any viable future for a community. This requires use of a flexible and balanced approach that acknowledges the importance of adapting new technologies and ecological practices, such as rainwater collection and solar energy collectors, in efficient and affordable ways, while, at the same time, remaining sensitive to preservation of historic features and the overall character and appearance of the neighborhood.

The guidelines for *Sustainability and Energy Retrofits* in Section 5.5 are written with the combined goals of preservation and sustainability in mind. Property owners, the Neighborhood Association, and the Historic Preservation Commission will collaborate as partners in finding workable and cost-effective solutions to preserve our homes while improving the environment. In this way, the Elm Heights Historic District is at the forefront of a national movement to combine historic preservation and sustainability efforts in a mutually supportive way.



DRAFT